

Old-Fashioned Peanut Butter Cream Pie: An Amish-Inspired Delight

Here's what you'll need to create this delectable Old-Fashioned Peanut Butter Cream Pie:



TIME
1 min

PRINT
Recipe Card

SAVE
PDF

SOURCE
ChefManiac

INGREDIENTS

- 1 (9-inch) pie crust, already baked and cooled
- 1/2 cup all-purpose flour
- 1 cup granulated sugar
- 1/2 teaspoon salt
- 2 1/2 cups full-fat milk
- 3 large egg yolks, lightly beaten
- 1/2 cup creamy peanut butter (such as Jif or Skippy)
- 2 tablespoons unsalted butter, softened
- 1 teaspoon vanilla extract
- 1 cup heavy cream (or heavy whipping cream), very cold
- 2 tablespoons confectioners' sugar (also known as pulverized sugar or powdered sugar)
- (Optional) Chopped roasted peanuts or chocolate shavings, for garnish

DIRECTIONS

1. Prepare the : Filling:
2. Combine : Dry Ingredients: In a medium-sized, heavy-bottomed saucepan, combine the 1/2 cup all-purpose flour, 1 cup granulated sugar, and 1/2 teaspoon salt. Whisk well to ensure these dry ingredients are thoroughly mixed and there are no lumps.
3. Gradually : Add Milk: Slowly, in a steady stream, add the 2 1/2 cups full-fat milk to the dry mixture, whisking constantly. Continue stirring until the mixture is smooth and evenly combined. This slow addition helps prevent lumps from forming.
4. Cook the : Mixture: Place the saucepan over medium heat. Bring the mixture to a gentle boil, stirring continuously with a whisk or wooden spoon to prevent scorching at the bottom. Once it reaches a boil, continue cooking for another 1 minute, stirring occasionally, until the mixture thickens to a pudding-like consistency. It should coat the back of a spoon.
5. Incorporate : Egg Yolks (Tempering): Remove the saucepan from the heat. In a separate small bowl, lightly beat the 3 egg yolks. To temper the yolks (prevent them from scrambling), slowly add about 1/2 cup of the hot milk mixture into the beaten egg yolks, whisking constantly and vigorously. This gradually raises the temperature of the yolks.
6. Return to : Saucepan: Once the yolks are tempered, pour the egg yolk mixture back into the saucepan with the remaining hot milk mixture.
7. Simmer and : Stir: Return the saucepan to low heat. Simmer, stirring constantly, for another 2 minutes.

The mixture will thicken further and become very smooth. Do not let it boil vigorously after adding the egg yolks.

8. **Add : Peanut Butter and Flavorings:** Immediately remove the saucepan from the heat. Stir in the 1/2 cup creamy peanut butter, 2 tablespoons unsalted butter (softened), and 1 teaspoon vanilla extract. Mix vigorously until the butter and peanut butter are completely melted and fully incorporated into the hot filling, creating a silky smooth and homogenous mixture.
9. **Assemble the : Pie:**
10. **Cool the : Filling:** Pour the hot peanut butter filling into a clean bowl or shallow dish. Place plastic wrap directly on the surface of the filling to prevent a skin from forming as it cools. Allow the filling to cool to room temperature. This step is crucial for achieving the perfect set and smooth consistency.
11. **Fill the : Pie Crust:** Once the filling has cooled completely (it should still be pourable but noticeably thicker), pour it into your pre-baked 9-inch pie crust. Use a spatula to smooth the top for an even layer.
12. **Chill the : Pie:** Place the pie, uncovered initially, in the refrigerator to chill for at least 3 hours, or preferably until the filling is fully set and firm. This chilling time allows the flavors to meld and the filling to firm up perfectly, making it easy to slice.
13. **Prepare the : Whipped Cream Topping:**
14. **Whip the : Cream:** Just before serving, ensure your heavy cream is very cold. In a cold mixing bowl, combine the 1 cup heavy cream and 2 tablespoons confectioners' sugar. Using an electric mixer (or a whisk), whip on medium-high speed until soft peaks form. Be careful not to over- whip, or it will become grainy.
15. **Top the : Pie:** Gently spread the freshly whipped cream over the chilled and set pie filling.
16. **Garnish (Optional):** For an added touch, garnish the top with chopped roasted peanuts or chocolate shavings.

SWAPS & NOTES

Pie Crust: While a classic butter pie crust is ideal, you can use a graham cracker crust for a different texture and complementary flavor.

Milk: Full-fat milk is recommended for the richest, creamiest filling.

Skim or low-fat milk can be used but may result in a slightly less rich texture.

Peanut Butter: Creamy peanut butter is essential for a smooth filling.

TIPS FOR SUCCESS

Pre-Bake Your Crust: Ensure your pie crust is fully baked and completely cooled before adding the filling.

A soggy bottom is the enemy of a good cream pie!

Whisk Constantly: When cooking the filling, continuous whisking is key to prevent lumps and scorching, especially once the milk is added and as it thickens.

Temper Egg Yolks Properly: Don't skip the tempering step.

More recipes: [ChefManiac.com](https://chefmaniac.com)

Original recipe: <https://chefmaniac.com/old-fashioned-peanut-butter-cream-pie-an-amish-inspired-delight/>